

# Country Advice

## **Pakistan**

**Refugee Review Tribunal** 

Pakistan – PAK37541 – Hazaras – Shi'ites – Baluchistan – Quetta – Taliban – Lashkare-Jhangvi – Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan – Internal relocation – Extrajudicial killings – State protection 14 October 2010

### 1. Are Hazara Shi'ites targeted by the Taliban?

Hazaras have been targeted for harm by radical anti Shi'ite Deobandi militias, including Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LJ) and Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP). Both groups are members of Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and all three are often referred to by the shorthand term, the Taliban. The vast majority of targeted killings of Hazaras have taken place in Baluchistan, especially in the provincial capital Quetta. The primary reason for such targeting appears to be the Deobandi groups' violent opposition to Shia Islam, rather than ethnic hatred. Deobandis are also opposed to music and various other art forms; however, there is no evidence that musicians or artists in Baluchistan have been specifically targeted for harm by Deobandi radicals.

The vast majority of ethnic Hazaras, both in Pakistan and Afghanistan, are Shi'ite Muslims, primarily of the Twelver sect; however, there is also a small minority of Sunni Hazaras. Australia's Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) estimates that there are up to 600,000 Hazaras living throughout Pakistan. The Daily Times estimates that there are over 300,000 Hazaras in Baluchistan<sup>2</sup>; however, DFAT suggests that there are at least 350,000 Hazaras in Quetta alone. According to DFAT, while there has been a Hazara community in Baluchistan for over a century, the majority have arrived in the province after 1996. Since 1982, a "Hazara Town" has developed as a suburb of Quetta, with estimates currently putting its Hazara population at 70,000.

Hazaras, like other non-Baluchi ethnic groups, are common victims of violence perpetrated by secular Baluchi militant groups in Baluchistan (discussed in greater detail in the response to question 2). However, the Hazara community appears to have borne the brunt of the considerable sectarian violence in the province, perpetrated by TTP affiliated groups; as a large, majority Shia community in Quetta, the Hazaras are a conspicuous

<sup>1</sup> Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, The Hazara Community, 20 May – Attachment 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story\_6-2-2009\_pg7\_15">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story\_6-2-2009\_pg7\_15</a> – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *Conditions for Asylum Caseloads: Hazaras in Quetta*, 30 July – Attachment 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *The Hazara Community*, 20 May – Attachment 1

target for the Taliban (as they were in Afghanistan). A July 2010 DFAT report states that "[t]he security situation in Baluchistan, particularly Quetta, is generally poor", and that "[t]he Hazari community is specifically affected by sectarian killings of Shi'a by armed Sunni groups". According to Pakistan's *Daily Times*, much of the responsibility for the anti-Hazara-Shi'ite violence in Baluchistan over the past decade has been claimed by LJ.6

Attacks on Hazaras/Shi'as in Baluchistan have resulted in mass casualties. On 3 September 2010 up to 73 Shi'ites were killed and over 200 injured in a suicide bombing in Ouetta. The attack took place during a demonstration in support of Palestinians. According to Reporters Without Borders, Lashkar-e-Jhangvi claimed responsibility for the attack. The UN News Service reported that the Pakistani Taliban claimed that the attack was "revenge for the killing of a Sunni Muslim leader last year."

Other large scale attacks on Hazari Shi'ites over the past decade include: the July 2003 bombing of a Shia mosque in Quetta that left more than 50 people dead; a March 2004 attack on a Shia Ashura procession that killed 38; and a March 2005 bombing of a Shi'ite shrine in Jhal Magsi that killed 65. The International Crisis Group (ICG) states that the "Pakistani Taliban and other Sunni radical groups including Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and SSP" were responsible for these attacks. 10

Apart from large scale attacks there have been periods during which waves of numerous, small scale attacks have occurred. One of the most recent such periods was between January and October 2009. In January 2009 three Shia Hazari policemen were killed on Siryab Road, Quetta.<sup>11</sup> On 26 January 2009, Hussain Ali Yousafi, the chairman of the Hazara Democratic Party, was killed in Quetta.<sup>12</sup> In March 2009 three Hazari construction workers were shot dead in Quetta. 13 Also in March 2009 *The Nation* reported the killing of two Shia Hazaras men while driving down Arbab Karam Khan Road in Quetta by armed men on motorcycles. <sup>14</sup> The *Baluchistan Times* reported that nine Hazaras

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, Conditions for Asylum Caseloads: Hazaras in Quetta, 30 July – Attachment 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story 6-2-2009 pg7 15 - Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Hughes, M. 2010, 'Suicide attack death toll reaches 73 in Quetta Pakistan', *The Examiner*, 4 September http://www.examiner.com/afghanistan-headlines-in-national/suicide-attack-death-toll-reaches-73-quettapakistan-video – Accessed 8 October 2010 – Attachmrent 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Reporters Without Borders 2010, 'Journalists killed and injured in Quetta bombing, reporter kidnapped in Islamabad', UNHCR Refworld, 6 September http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c8df29814.html -Accessed 11 October 2010 – Attachment 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> UN News Service 2010, UN chief deplores deadly attacks against Pakistan's Shiite Muslims, UNHCR Refworld, 3 September http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c84aca21a.html - Accessed 7 October 2010 -Attachment 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> International Crisis Group 2009, Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge, Asia Report no.164, 13 March, p.16 – Attachment 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> 'Pakistan: 2009: Year of Terrorism' 2009, *Daily The Pak Banker*, 25 December – Attachment 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Akbar, M.S. 2009, "'Mastermind" of sectarian killings held in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 13 November http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory 13-11-2009 pg7 3 - Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 9

Shahid, S. 2010, 'Retired SP among three shot dead in Quetta', *Dawn*, 18 March http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/retired-spamong-3-shot-dead-in-quetta-830 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 10 <sup>14</sup> '2 tribesmen gunned down' 2009, *The Nation*, 9 March – Attachment 11

were killed in a ten day period in March 2009.<sup>15</sup> In June 2009 the Shi'ite Hazari headmaster of a local school in Quetta was shot.<sup>16</sup> On 1 October 2009 a Hazari lawyer, Advocate Wulayet, was killed.<sup>17</sup> In 2010 small but deadly attacks have continued; on 28 September 2010 at least two Hazari vegetable sellers were killed and two others were seriously injured in Quetta when their truck came under fire.<sup>18</sup>

In addition to the presence of the TTP affiliates LJ and SSP in Quetta, there is a common view among strategic analysts that the city is home to members of the high command of one of the three known factions of Afghanistan's Taliban. A June 2010 UK House of Commons research paper states that the main Shura (council) of Afghan Taliban, who have a history of targeting Hazaras, is based in Quetta. <sup>19</sup> The Long War Journal states that the Quetta Shura is actually headed by Mullah Mohammed Omar himself. <sup>20</sup> The ICG has also described Quetta as "the Afghan Taliban's headquarters". <sup>21</sup>

As well as the Taliban leadership presence in Quetta, there is also a considerable presence of Taliban jihadis in districts northeast of the city. In January 2010 *BBC News* stated that the American intervention in Afghanistan forced jihadis from the Taliban's Haqqani faction to establish "a strong presence along Baluchistan's border with Kandahar and Helmand provinces of Afghanistan." *BBC News* also argues that missile strikes by US drones in Waziristan and operations by Pakistani forces are "pushing an increasing number of Taliban fighters into areas north-east of Quetta" and quote an anonymous government official who states that Haqqani Taliban are "flocking to the Toba Kakar area of Balochistan, and it was only a matter of time before they spread west to Qilla Abdullah district, and the Quetta region itself." 22

It has been well documented that the Taliban oppose cultural 'perversions', in addition to all other non-Deobandi sects of Islam. The Taliban in Afghanistan famously imposed restrictions on the movements of women, as well as announced edicts banning such things as music, kite flying, the shaving of men's beards, as well as pictures and portraits.<sup>23</sup> In January 2010 Pakistan's *Daily Times* stated that the Taliban and 'religious fanatics' have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> 'Three escape unhurt in row of target killings in Quetta' 2009, *Baluchistan Times*, 11 March – Attachment 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> 'Quetta shuts down after target killings' 2009, *Dawn*, 23 June <a href="http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/metropolitan/07-quetta-shut-down-after-target-killings-claim-three-lives-ha-05">http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/metropolitan/07-quetta-shut-down-after-target-killings-claim-three-lives-ha-05</a> – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> 'Target-Killing Campaign; Advocate Wulayet Murdered' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan, 3 October <a href="http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/03/target-killing-campaign-advocate-wulayet-murdered/">http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/03/target-killing-campaign-advocate-wulayet-murdered/</a> – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> '2 Hazaras Killed in HazarGanji' 2010, Hazara News Pakistan, 2 October
<a href="http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/10/02/2-hazaras-killed-in-hazarganji/">http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/10/02/2-hazaras-killed-in-hazarganji/</a> – Accessed 11 October 2010 – Attachment 15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> UK Parliament House of Commons Library 2010, *The 'AfPak policy' and the Pashtuns*, Research Paper 10/45, 22 June, p.13 – Attachment 16

<sup>22</sup> June, p.13 – Attachment 16

<sup>20</sup> Joscelyn, T. & Roggio, B. 2010, 'Afghan president meets with Siraj Haqqani: Report', The Long War Journal, 27 June <a href="http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/06/afghan\_president\_mee.php">http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/06/afghan\_president\_mee.php</a> – Accessed 12 October 2010 – Attachment 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report no.164, 13 March, p.16 – Attachment 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Khan, M.I. 2010, 'On the trail of the Taliban in Quetta', *BBC News*, 25 January <a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8472740.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8472740.stm</a> – Accessed 12 March 2010 – Attachment 18

http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8472740.stm - Accessed 12 March 2010 - Attachment 18

Bahadur, K. 2006, 'Regional Implications of the Rise of Islamic Fundamentalism in Pakistan', *Strategic Analysis*, Vol. 30, No. 1, Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses, Jan-Mar, p.19

http://www.idsa.in/system/files/strategicanalysis kbahadur 0306.pdf - Accessed 8 October 2010 - Attachment 19

killed artists; however, no examples are provided. The article is a call to arms to prevent a repeat in Baluchistan. <sup>24</sup>

Despite evidence of the Afghani Taliban's base in Quetta, such cultural impositions have yet to be imposed on the population of the city. A March 2010 report on the media in Baluchistan by the Pakistani organisation Intermedia indicates that the city is home to radio stations, such as 101 FM, that play Punjabi and Urdu 'pop' songs by Pakistani artists such as "Abrarul Haq, Jawad Ahmad, Rahim Shah, Atif Aslam, Ali Zafar, Sajjad Ali and Ahmad." Furthermore, "TV and cable is everywhere in Quetta and people request songs they see on the music channels." However, the report states that people only publicly listen to such 'pop' within the relative safety of "the fortress of Quetta cantonment". Outside the cantonment, in public spaces and on public transport, traditional Pashtun and Balochi music is more commonly heard. <sup>25</sup>

#### 2. What is the status of state protection in Balochistan?

Quetta is described by one 2010 source as a "garrison city". Nevertheless, neither the armed forces nor the police in Baluchistan appear capable of providing adequate protection to people targeted by either Baluchi nationalists or Sunni extremists. Indeed, many police are either victims of sectarian violence, or suspected perpetrators.

In September 2010 Australia's Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) indicated that the situation has deteriorated since Post's last visit to Quetta in July 2010, and subsequently staff are currently unable to undertake "regular travel" to the city.<sup>27</sup>

Baluchi tribal militants have been engaged in a long-running low-level insurgency against the Pakistan state and army. Some insurgents advocate complete secession from Pakistan, while others demand "greater control of the region's natural resources and political power." After a six month ceasefire, Baluchi armed groups resumed politically motivated kidnappings and killings in January 2009. Targets of these acts include all non-Baluchis and cover the entire political and economic spectrum. In April 2009 the Baluchistan Liberation Army (BLA) claimed responsibility for the killing of a member of the Baluchistan Constabulary, Javaid Iqbal, and the kidnapping and murder of six coalmine workers, reportedly "seized from their residential compounds in Margat area of the district." In April 2010 two attacks on the same day, allegedly by Baluchi gunmen, claimed 16 lives; in one incident six Punjabis were killed while painting a house in Quetta. In the second incident, gunmen boarded a bus at Aab-e-Ghum, approximately 50 kilometres from Quetta, and apparently "singled out and shot dead 10 passengers on a bus

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> 'Pakistan: Sectarian menace again' 2010, *Daily Times*, 1 February – Attachment 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Khan, A. 2010, *Media In Balochistan: Blighted But A Brave New World Beckons*, Intermedia, p.40 <a href="http://intermedia.org.pk/pdf/BALOCHISTAN%20REPORT%20FINAL-2010%20white.pdf">http://intermedia.org.pk/pdf/BALOCHISTAN%20REPORT%20FINAL-2010%20white.pdf</a> – Accessed 8 October 2010 – Attachment 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Khan, A. 2010, Media In Balochistan: Blighted But A Brave New World Beckons, Intermedia, p.77
<a href="http://intermedia.org.pk/pdf/BALOCHISTAN%20REPORT%20FINAL-2010%20white.pdf">http://intermedia.org.pk/pdf/BALOCHISTAN%20REPORT%20FINAL-2010%20white.pdf</a> – Accessed 8
October 2010 – Attachment 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> DIAC Country Information Service 2010, *Country Information Report No. 10/60 – Pakistan: The Hazaras*, (sourced from DFAT advice of 28 September 2010), 29 September – Attachment 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> 'Pakistan: 2009: Year of Terrorism' 2009, *Daily The Pak Banker*, 25 December – Attachment 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Amnesty International 2010, Amnesty International Report – Pakistan, 28 May, p.250 – Attachment 23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> 'Pakistan police say 11 killed in Baluchistan violence' 2009, *BBC Monitoring*, source: *Associated Press of Pakistan*, 12 April – Attachment 24

who were not ethnic Baluchis." Plus News Pakistan reported that during 2009 83 Punjabi and Sindhi settlers in Baluchistan were killed, primarily by members of the BLA and the Baloch Republican Army (BRA). In February 2009, John Solecki, the head of the UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR) office in Quetta, was kidnapped, reportedly by Baluchi militants; however, he was released several weeks later. 33

Despite the Baluchi nationalist insurgency, sources indicate that most killings in the province are sectarian. As described in the response to question 1, Baluchistan has witnessed numerous terrorist attacks on the Shia community, many of whom are ethnic Hazaras. Rather than receiving protection from the police, policemen are either victims themselves, or suspected perpetrators. The International Crisis Group (ICG) states that there are numerous 'Sunni radicals' among the provincial police and that clashes between police and Hazaras have resulted in numerous Hazari deaths; on 19 July 2008, nine Hazara protesters were killed in a clash with police. It also states that Hazari policemen are a "particular target" and there are a number of sources to corroborate this claim. In January 2009 four policemen, three of them Shi'ites, were also killed in Quetta. All four of them were Hazara, according to *Dawn*. Hazari Deputy Superintendent of Police Ghulam Mohammad, who survived this attack, was later killed on 16 April 2010. In June 2003, 8 Hazara police cadets were killed upon their "return from holiday".

The provincial police have had a few successes arresting those allegedly responsible for violent attacks on the Shi'ite/Hazari community in Baluchistan. In November 2009 police arrested Lashkar-e-Jhangvi member Hafiz Muhammad Usman Muhammad Shahi, aka Abbas, in relation to 16 cases of terrorism, resulting in the death of at least 28 members of the Shia-Hazara community. Abbas reportedly confessed to being involved in the murder of Hussain Ali Yousafi, the assassinated chairman of the Hazara Democratic Party (HDP), killed in Quetta on 26 January 2009. Despite this arrest, members of the HDP staged a mass protest in March 2010, during which the Secretary of the party, Abdul Khaliq

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> 'Pakistan gunmen kill 16 in ethnic attacks' 2010, UNHCR Refworld, source: *Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty*,14 August <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c7633c31c.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c7633c31c.html</a> – Accessed 11 October 2010 – Attachment 25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> 'Pakistan: 83 Punjabi and Sindhis killed in Balochistan during last year' 2010, *Plus News Pakistan*, 17 February – Attachment 26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> 'Pakistan: A dangerous mixture in Balochistan' 2010, *IRIN News*, 1 March http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=88267 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report no.164, 13 March, p.16

Attachment 7

<sup>35 &#</sup>x27;Riots erupt in Quetta after the killing of Hazara Democratic Party leader' 2009, *The Nation*, 26 January http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Politics/26-Jan-2009/Riots-erupt-in-Quetta-after-the-killing-of-Hazara-Democratic-Party-leader — Accessed 30 March 2010 — Attachment 30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> DSP gunned down in Quetta' 2009, *Dawn*, 15 January <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/15/top9.htm">http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/15/top9.htm</a> – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 31

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Mohammadi, I. 2010, 'Reasons for the Target Killing of Hazaras in Balochistan, Pakistan', Hazara.net, 22 August, p.2 <a href="http://www.hazara.net/downloads/Hazara\_Ethnic\_Cleansing\_Pakistan.pdf">http://www.hazara.net/downloads/Hazara\_Ethnic\_Cleansing\_Pakistan.pdf</a> – Accessed 11 October 2010 – Attachment 32

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Idris, I. 2004, 'Carnage in Quetta', *Al-Ahram*, no.681, 11-17 March <a href="http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm">http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm</a> – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Akbar, M.S. 2009, "'Mastermind" of sectarian killings held in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 13 November <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory</a> 13-11-2009 pg7 3 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 2

Hazara, claimed that "sectarian outfits have been given free hands and perpetrators of Hazara target killing have not been arrested". $^{40}$ 

As well as arguing that Sunni radicals have infiltrated the police, in 2007 the ICG argued strongly that the Pakistan Army actively supports Pashtun Deobandi organisations "such as Maulana Fazlur Rehman's Deobandi Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI-F) in a bid to counter secular Baloch and moderate Pashtun forces." This history of supporting radical and violent Deobandi organisations by the Army to counter tribal nationalism and Shia Islam has its origins during the rule of Zia ul Haq, who developed links between Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP) and the Inter Services Intelligence (ISI). Indeed, Tahir Kamran argues that both the SSP and LJ enjoyed state patronage and funding during the 1970s and 1980s. Other authors suggest that they still do. In the calculus of conflict, it would appear that the Pakistan Army has deduced that the Baluchi separatists pose a greater threat to the state and/or are easier to defeat than the Taliban.

Writing in *The Nation* in March 2009, Aziz-ud-din Ahmad provided a grim assessment of the security situation in Baluchistan and Quetta; "[t]hanks [to] the apathy on the part of Islamabad, Balochistan is in unending turmoil. Not a day passes without news of sabotage activities that include attacks on gas pipelines, power distribution system, railway lines and paramilitary personnel and police. Meanwhile Quetta has turned into the most dangerous city in the country. Nobody is safe, be he Punjabi, Baloch, Pushtun, or Hazara. As in the case of John Solecki, foreigners are on the hit list now. No area including the cantonment can claim to be outside the reach of the terrorists. Terrorists of all hues and colours are active. There have been sectarian killings and attacks on settlers and on law enforcement personnel."<sup>44</sup>

#### 3. Would it be possible for Hazara Shi'ites to relocate within Pakistan?

Outside of Baluchistan, there is little objective reporting in the Pakistan media on the welfare of Hazaras in Pakistan. However, it cannot be assumed that this is due to a state of relative safety outside of the province. Factors affecting the reportage include the relatively small numbers of Hazaras outside Baluchistan, and the potential for Hazara casualties from sectarian terrorist events to be reported only as Shi'ites. In September 2010 Australia's Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) lamented that they have been unable to receive any credible information regarding Hazara communities in Pakistan from their usual sources, including the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR), the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, and the International

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> 'HDP Protests Hazara Target Killing' 2010, Hazara News Pakistan, 21 March <a href="http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/03/21/hdp-protests-hazara-target-killing/">http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/03/21/hdp-protests-hazara-target-killing/</a> – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 34

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> International Crisis Group 2007, *Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan*, Asia Briefing no.69, 22 October, p.1 – Attachment 29

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Kamran, T. 2008, *The Political Economy of Sectarianism: Jhang*, University of Bradford, 9 May, pp.6-7 <a href="http://spaces.brad.ac.uk:8080/download/attachments/748/Brief32finalised.pdf">http://spaces.brad.ac.uk:8080/download/attachments/748/Brief32finalised.pdf</a> – Accessed 8 October 2010 – Attachment 36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Mohammadi, I. 2010, 'Reasons for the Target Killing of Hazaras in Balochistan, Pakistan', Hazara.net, 22 August, p.2 <a href="http://www.hazara.net/downloads/Hazara\_Ethnic\_Cleansing\_Pakistan.pdf">http://www.hazara.net/downloads/Hazara\_Ethnic\_Cleansing\_Pakistan.pdf</a> – Accessed 11 October 2010 – Attachment 32

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Ahmad, A. 2009, 'For Balochistan, from bad to worse', *The Nation*, 26 March <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Opinions/Columns/26-Mar-2009/For-Balochistan-from-bad-to-worse">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Opinions/Columns/26-Mar-2009/For-Balochistan-from-bad-to-worse</a> – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 35

Organisation of Migration. Furthermore, information from representatives of the Hazara community in Pakistan "cannot be assumed to be unbiased."

What can be reported is that while a majority of Hazaras in Pakistan live in and around the city of Quetta, there are Hazara communities elsewhere in Pakistan, notably in Karachi, Lahore and Multan. The 'Hazaras' of Hazara Division, Khyber-Pakhtoonkhwa (formerly known as North West Frontier Province) are not ethnic Hazaras but un-related Hindko. Reports in the Pakistan media on Hazara communities in large cities of Pakistan (apart from Quetta) often provide little clarity on whether they are referring to ethnic Hazaras or people from Hazara Division, Khyber-Pakhtoonkhwa province. Recent clashes in Karachi between members of the Hazara Community and supporters of the Awami National Party (ANP) did not involve ethnic Hazaras. 'Hazara' organisations that are behind such clashes, Tehreek-e-Sooba Hazara (TSH) and Hazara Qaumi Mahaz (HQM), are Hazara Division organisations that advocate the creation of a separate Hindko Hazara province and oppose the renaming of North West Frontier Province to Khyber-Pakhtoonkhwa in April 2010. 47 48 They are not ethnic Hazara political parties.

Pakistan citizens have the right under Article 15 of the Pakistan Constitution to "move freely throughout Pakistan and to reside and settle in any part thereof"; however, Article 15 also states that this right may be subject to "reasonable restrictions imposed by law in the public interest". <sup>49</sup> Hazari citizens of Pakistan therefore technically have the right to move to one of the major cities in Pakistan. No information has been located on whether or not Hazaras, citizens or otherwise, are discriminated against in housing or employment.

Shi'ites, as well as Ahmadis, Christians and Barelvi Sunnis visiting Sufi shrines, continue to be the subject of targeted attacks throughout Pakistan, particularly by Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP). The Jamestown Foundation Terrorism Monitor states that the SSP was formed on 6 September 1985 in the Punjabi city of Jhang "with the core mission of targeting Shi'as, whom the group believes are non-Muslims." Despite being banned, there are reports that SSP has been reorganising in places like Karachi and in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). In 2008 Pakistan's *Daily Times* reported that following a period of going underground, Sipah-e-Sahaba had changed its name to Ahl-e-Sunnat-Wal Jamaat and began to reopen "their sealed offices", including in the city of Karachi. S1

http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no\_cache=1&tx\_ttnews%5Btt\_news%5D=323 - Accessed 12 October 2010 - Attachment 39

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> DIAC Country Information Service 2010, *Country Information Report No. 10/60 – Pakistan: The Hazaras*, (sourced from DFAT advice of 28 September 2010), 29 September – Attachment 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade 2010, *The Hazara Community*, 20 May – Attachment 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> 'Hazara community refutes MQM's claim' 2010, Hazara.com.pk, 22 May <a href="http://www.hazara.com.pk/newsdetails.php?newsid=50">http://www.hazara.com.pk/newsdetails.php?newsid=50</a> – Accessed 12 October 2010 – Attachment 37

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Medhi, N. 2010, 'HQM protests NWFP renaming', *The Nation*, 12 April <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Regional/Karachi/12-Apr-2010/HQM-protests-NWFP-renaming-Accessed 12 October 2010 – Attachment 38</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Human Rights Commission of Pakistan 2005, *The State of Human Rights in 2005*, HRCP website, p.1 – Attachment 41

Attachment 41
50 Roul, A. 2005, 'Sipah-e-Sahaba: Fomenting Sectarian Violence in Pakistan', *Jamestown Foundation Terrorism Monitor*, Voluem 3, Issue 2, 5 May

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Khan, F. 2008, 'Banned militant outfits regroup in Karachi', *Daily Times*, 29 June <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C06%5C29%5Cstory">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C06%5C29%5Cstory</a> 29-6-2008 pg7 54 – Accessed 28 October 2008 – Attachment 40

#### **Attachments**

- 1. Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *The Hazara Community*, 20 May. (CISNET Pakistan CX243899)
- 2. Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story\_6-2-2009\_pg7\_15">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story\_6-2-2009\_pg7\_15</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 3. Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, Conditions for Asylum Caseloads: Hazaras in Quetta, 30 July. (CISNET Pakistan CX246851)
- 4. Hughes, M. 2010, 'Suicide attack death toll reaches 73 in Quetta Pakistan', *The Examiner*, 4 September <a href="http://www.examiner.com/afghanistan-headlines-in-national/suicide-attack-death-toll-reaches-73-quetta-pakistan-video">http://www.examiner.com/afghanistan-headlines-in-national/suicide-attack-death-toll-reaches-73-quetta-pakistan-video</a> Accessed 8 October 2010.
- 5. Reporters Without Borders 2010, 'Journalists killed and injured in Quetta bombing, reporter kidnapped in Islamabad', UNHCR Refworld, 6 September <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c8df29814.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c8df29814.html</a> Accessed 11 October 2010.
- 6. UN News Service 2010, UN chief deplores deadly attacks against Pakistan's Shiite Muslims, UNHCR Refworld, 3 September <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c84aca21a.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c84aca21a.html</a> Accessed 7 October 2010.
- 7. International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report no.164, 13 March.
- 8. 'Pakistan: 2009: Year of Terrorism' 2009, *Daily The Pak Banker*, 25 December. (FACTIVA)
- 9. Akbar, M.S. 2009, "'Mastermind" of sectarian killings held in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 13 November <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory\_13-11-2009\_pg7\_3">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory\_13-11-2009\_pg7\_3</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 10. Shahid, S. 2010, 'Retired SP among three shot dead in Quetta', *Dawn*, 18 March <a href="http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/retired-sp-among-3-shot-dead-in-quetta-830">http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/retired-sp-among-3-shot-dead-in-quetta-830</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 11. '2 tribesmen gunned down' 2009, *The Nation*, 9 March. (FACTIVA)
- 12. 'Three escape unhurt in row of target killings in Quetta' 2009, *Baluchistan Times*, 11 March. (FACTIVA)
- 13. 'Quetta shuts down after target killings' 2009, *Dawn*, 23 June <a href="http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/metropolitan/07-quetta-shut-down-after-target-killings-claim-three-lives-ha-05">http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/metropolitan/07-quetta-shut-down-after-target-killings-claim-three-lives-ha-05</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.

- 14. 'Target-Killing Campaign; Advocate Wulayet Murdered' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 3 October <a href="http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/03/target-killing-campaign-advocate-wulayet-murdered/">http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/03/target-killing-campaign-advocate-wulayet-murdered/</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 15. '2 Hazaras Killed in HazarGanji' 2010, Hazara News Pakistan, 2 October <a href="http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/10/02/2-hazaras-killed-in-hazarganji/">http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/10/02/2-hazaras-killed-in-hazarganji/</a> Accessed 11 October 2010.
- 16. UK Parliament House of Commons Library 2010, *The 'AfPak policy' and the Pashtuns*, Research Paper 10/45, 22 June.
- 17. Joscelyn, T. & Roggio, B. 2010, 'Afghan president meets with Siraj Haqqani: Report', The Long War Journal, 27 June

  <a href="http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/06/afghan\_president\_mee.php">http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/06/afghan\_president\_mee.php</a> Accessed 12 October 2010.
- 18. Khan, M.I. 2010, 'On the trail of the Taliban in Quetta', *BBC News*, 25 January <a href="http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8472740.stm">http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/8472740.stm</a> Accessed 12 March 2010. (CISNET Pakistan CX2408651)
- 19. Bahadur, K. 2006, 'Regional Implications of the Rise of Islamic Fundamentalism in Pakistan', *Strategic Analysis*, Vol. 30, No. 1, Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses, January-March <a href="http://www.idsa.in/system/files/strategicanalysis\_kbahadur\_0306.pdf">http://www.idsa.in/system/files/strategicanalysis\_kbahadur\_0306.pdf</a> Accessed 8 October 2010.
- 20. 'Pakistan: Sectarian menace again' 2010, *Daily Times*, 1 February. (FACTIVA)
- 21. Khan, A. 2010, *Media In Balochistan: Blighted But A Brave New World Beckons*, Intermedia, 26 March <a href="http://intermedia.org.pk/pdf/BALOCHISTAN%20REPORT%20FINAL-2010%20white.pdf">http://intermedia.org.pk/pdf/BALOCHISTAN%20REPORT%20FINAL-2010%20white.pdf</a> Accessed 8 October 2010.
- 22. DIAC Country Information Service 2010, *Country Information Report No. 10/60 Pakistan: The Hazaras*, (sourced from DFAT advice of 28 September 2010), 29 September.
- 23. Amnesty International 2010, Amnesty International Report Pakistan, 28 May.
- 24. 'Pakistan police say 11 killed in Baluchistan violence' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Newsfile*, source: *Associated Press of Pakistan* (11 April 2009), 12 April. (FACTIVA)
- 25. 'Pakistan gunmen kill 16 in ethnic attacks' 2010, UNHCR Refworld, source: *Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty*, 14 August <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c7633c31c.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c7633c31c.html</a> Accessed 11 October 2010.
- 26. 'Pakistan: 83 Punjabi and Sindhis killed in Balochistan during last year' 2010, *Plus News Pakistan*, 17 February. (FACTIVA)
- 27. 'Pakistan: A dangerous mixture in Balochistan' 2010, *IRIN News*, 1 March <a href="http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=88267">http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=88267</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.

- 28. 'Pakistan: Outsiders flee violence-stricken Balochistan after nationalist murders' 2009, *IRIN News*, 12 April <a href="http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=83898">http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=83898</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 29. International Crisis Group 2007, *Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan*, Asia Briefing no.69, 22 October.
- 30. 'Riots erupt in Quetta after the killing of Hazara Democratic Party leader' 2009, *The Nation*, 26 January <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Politics/26-Jan-2009/Riots-erupt-in-Quetta-after-the-killing-of-Hazara-Democratic-Party-leader Accessed 30 March 2010."
- 31. DSP gunned down in Quetta' 2009, *Dawn*, 15 January <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/15/top9.htm">http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/15/top9.htm</a> Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 32. Mohammadi, I. 2010, 'Reasons for the Target Killing of Hazaras in Balochistan, Pakistan', Hazara.net, 22 August <a href="http://www.hazara.net/downloads/Hazara">http://www.hazara.net/downloads/Hazara</a> Ethnic Cleansing Pakistan.pdf Accessed 11 October 2010.
- 33. Idris, I. 2004, 'Carnage in Quetta', *Al-Ahram*, no.681, 11-17 March <a href="http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm">http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm</a> Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 34. 'HDP Protests Hazara Target Killing' 2010, Hazara News Pakistan, 21 March <a href="http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/03/21/hdp-protests-hazara-target-killing/">http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/03/21/hdp-protests-hazara-target-killing/</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 35. Ahmad, A. 2009, 'For Balochistan, from bad to worse', *The Nation*, 26 March <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Opinions/Columns/26-Mar-2009/For-Balochistan-from-bad-to-worse">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Opinions/Columns/26-Mar-2009/For-Balochistan-from-bad-to-worse</a> Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 36. Kamran, T. 2008, *The Political Economy of Sectarianism: Jhang*, University of Bradford, 9 May <a href="http://spaces.brad.ac.uk:8080/download/attachments/748/Brief32finalised.pdf">http://spaces.brad.ac.uk:8080/download/attachments/748/Brief32finalised.pdf</a> Accessed 8 October 2010.
- 37. 'Hazara community refutes MQM's claim' 2010, Hazara.com.pk, 22 May <a href="http://www.hazara.com.pk/newsdetails.php?newsid=50">http://www.hazara.com.pk/newsdetails.php?newsid=50</a> Accessed 12 October 2010.
- 38. Medhi, N. 2010, 'HQM protests NWFP renaming', *The Nation*, 12 April <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Regional/Karachi/12-Apr-2010/HQM-protests-NWFP-renaming">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Regional/Karachi/12-Apr-2010/HQM-protests-NWFP-renaming</a> Accessed 12 October 2010.
- 39. Roul, A. 2005, 'Sipah-e-Sahaba: Fomenting Sectarian Violence in Pakistan', *Jamestown Foundation Terrorism Monitor*, Volume 3, Issue 2, 5 May <a href="http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no\_cache=1&tx\_ttnews%5Btt\_news%5D=323">http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no\_cache=1&tx\_ttnews%5Btt\_news%5D=323</a> Accessed 12 October 2010.
- 40. Khan, F. 2008, 'Banned militant outfits regroup in Karachi', *Daily Times*, 29 June <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C06%5C29%5Cstory\_29-6-2008\_pg7\_54">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C06%5C29%5Cstory\_29-6-2008\_pg7\_54</a> Accessed 28 October 2008.

41.	Human Rights Commission of Pakistan 2005, <i>The State of Human Rights in 2005</i> , HRCP website.