



Australian Government
Refugee Review Tribunal

Country Advice

Ukraine

Ukraine – UKR38131 – Lviv – Anti-Semitism – Militia – Birth Certificate – Identification - Jewish

16 February 2011

1. Would the fact that a person's mother was Jewish have been recorded on their birth certificate in 1981?

Yes. For persons born in 1981, birth certificates would have been issued by the Ukrainian Soviet Socialist Republic, a constituent republic of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics. Sources indicate that Soviet birth certificates contained a section for the “nationality” of the parents of the child (see image 1 below), and that the designation Jew or Jewish was used as a nationality/ethnicity in these documents.¹ Information for birth certificates was provided orally or in writing by one or both of the parents.² If a person’s mother was Jewish and chose to identify as such, this would be listed. It is noted that the ethnicity to be listed for the child was chosen by the parents³ and in the event of mixed parentage, the mother’s nationality was used as the default.⁴

It should be noted that the designation Jewish in Soviet documents does not necessarily correlate with the religious beliefs of the subject. The definition of what makes a person Jewish has been debated for centuries. In the Soviet Union, the designation “Jewish” related to the ethnic background of the individual and did not necessarily correspond to their religious beliefs⁵ (the Soviet Union was officially an atheist state).

¹ United States Court of Appeals Seventh Circuit 2008, 355 F.3d 1038 *Vassili KOURSKI, Petitioner, v. John ASHCROFT, Attorney General of the United States, Respondent*, January 22
<http://ftp.resource.org/courts.gov/c/F3/355/355.F3d.1038.03-1742.html> - Accessed 1 February 2011 – Attachment 1.

² Simons, W. 1980, *The Soviet Codes of Law*, Sijthoff & Noordhoff International Publishers, The Netherlands, p. 810, Googlebooks.com
http://books.google.com.au/books?id=n_w8t0UCFRgC&printsec=frontcover&dq=The+Soviet+Codes+of+Law&hl=en&ei=TbNUTfrpFcKPcf_MmKcF&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CCwQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 2 .

³ US Department of Justice 1994, *The Status of Jews in the post-Soviet era*, September, p. 30
<http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/ins/russia94.pdf> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 3.

⁴ Haarmann, H.1986, *Language in ethnicity: a view of basic ecological relations*, Walter de Gruyter & Co, Berlin, p. 62, Googlebooks.com
http://books.google.com.au/books?id=NUh_nsJpbMoC&printsec=frontcover&dq=Language+in+ethnicity:+a+view+of+basic+ecological+relations&hl=en&ei=OLhUTdv4I4WkuAPRmLXvBA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CC4Q6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 4.

⁵ Matlin, A. Undated, ‘The Jews Behind the Iron Curtain’, Alexander Matlin website
<http://sites.google.com/site/alexandermatlin/my-stories/stories-in-english/the-jews-behind-the-iron-curtain> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 5.

Sources are unclear if Soviet-issued birth certificates remain valid documents for use inside Ukraine or whether they need to be replaced by a new document issued by the Ukrainian government. The new Ukrainian birth certificate does not list the nationality of the child or the parents.⁶



- Image 1:⁷ Passport issued to child born in 1980 in Ukraine Soviet Socialist Republic. In the above image, the Ukrainian words for Jew (еврей⁸) and Jewess (еврейка⁹) are written in the space for the ethnicity of the father and mother.

⁶ Umland, A. 2005, 'Ukraine's Party System in Transition? The Rise of the Radically Right-Wing All-Ukrainian Association Svoboda', Geopolitika, <http://www.geopolitika.lt/?artc=4429> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 6.

⁷ 'Soviet birth certificate', undated, Flickr website, <http://www.flickr.com/photos/heroiclif/369583440/> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 7.

⁸ 'еврей' (Jew), undated, Google translation website, http://translate.google.com.au/translate_t?hl=&ie=UTF-8&text=%D0%95%D0%B2%D1%80%D0%B5%D0%B9&sl=uk&tl=en#en|uk|jew - Accessed 11 February 2011. Please note: Google translations can often be poor and can contain errors - as such they give only a rough indication of the contents of a document. For any further reliance on this information, a professional translation should be obtained.

⁹ 'еврейка' (Jewess), undated, Google translation website, http://translate.google.com.au/translate_t?hl=&ie=UTF-8&text=%D0%95%D0%B2%D1%80%D0%B5%D0%B9&sl=uk&tl=en#en|uk|jewess - Accessed 11 February 2011. Please note: Google translations can often be poor and can contain errors - as such they give only a rough indication of the contents of a document. For any further reliance on this information, a professional translation should be obtained.

2. Would a person still be identified as "Jewish" in official documentation today? If so, in what kind of documents?

No. The Ukrainian government commenced issuing its own documentation upon achieving independence in 1991.¹⁰ No sources were found stating that any official documents list the ethnicity or religion of a Ukrainian national apart from the ability to volunteer this information in census forms.¹¹ The main identification documents carried by Ukrainian citizens are an "international" passport used for overseas travel, and an internal passport or residency certificate known as a *propiska*. The *propiska* is issued by the Department of Internal Affairs and is required to access basic services such as housing, medical care, and pensions¹². No sources located indicate that the *propiska* list the ethnicity or religion of the holder, nor do other forms of identification such as driver's licenses.¹³ Ukrainian international passports do not list the nationality of the holder other than to identify them as Ukrainian citizens (image 2 below).¹⁴

¹⁰ Walkowitz, D. 1995, 'Normal Life in the New Ukraine: The Crisis of Identity Among Donetsk's Miners', *Radical History Review*: Volume 61, Winter, p. 65, Googlebooks.com http://books.google.com.au/books?id=d4aIhZ6KgVUC&pg=RA1-PA65&dq=first+Ukrainian+passports+1991&hl=en&ei=BZNUTa-3HcmPcZibvLsF&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=8&ved=0CE4Q6AEwBzge#v=onepage&q=first%20Ukrainian%20passports%201991&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 10.

¹¹ MacIsaac, D. Undated, 'Ukraine's Jews Say Fear Led to Low Numbers in Recent Census', The Jewish Federations of North America, <http://www.jewishfederations.org/page.aspx?id=38917> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 11.

¹² Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly 2001, *The propiska system applied to migrants, asylum seekers and refugees in Council of Europe member states: effects and remedies*, 12 October <http://assembly.coe.int/Documents/WorkingDocs/Doc01/edoc9262.htm> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 12.

¹³ MacIsaac, D. Undated, 'Ukraine's Jews Say Fear Led to Low Numbers in Recent Census', The Jewish Federations of North America, <http://www.jewishfederations.org/page.aspx?id=38917> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 11.

¹⁴ Ginsburgs, G., 1998, *From Soviet to Russian international law: studies in continuity and change*, Kluwer Law International, The Hague, p. 206, Googlebooks.com http://books.google.com.au/books?id=HOf3eV3OzokC&printsec=frontcover&dq=From+Soviet+to+Russian+international+law:+studies+in+continuity+and+change&hl=en&ei=WsVUTc7fNYLYuAPg0uj2BA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CDIQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 13.

memorials.¹⁸ No sources were located stating that crimes against Jewish people are above crime rates for non-Jewish Ukrainians, although accurate data on anti-Semitic crime is unavailable as authorities do not maintain statistics on racially motivated crime. According to Vladimir Matveyev, a visiting American journalist, Jewish residents today “don’t seem to be afraid” to live in Lviv, but do not draw attention to the fact that they are Jewish through their clothing.¹⁹ *Human Rights without Frontiers* reported no attacks on people or businesses in Lviv in 2010 although in Ternopil, a city approximately 100km away from Lviv, graveyards in a Jewish cemetery were vandalised in April 2010 with anti-Semitic graffiti.²⁰ The last reported attack on a Jewish person in Lviv was in July 2008 when a gang broke into a centre for “religious Jewish Youth” and attacked two workers with metal rods.²¹

Anti-Semitic activity in Ukraine is mostly limited to grave desecration, and anti-Semitic graffiti usually with a neo-Nazi undertone.²² Vyacheslav Likhachev, writing for the *Euro-Asian Jewish Congress*, claims that reported incidents of anti-Semitic violence in Ukraine has declined since the early 2000s.²³ Actual examples of physical violence and intimidation are rare²⁴ and appear to be limited to targeted assaults on prominent Jewish individuals or corporations, or random attacks on people visibly recognisable as Jewish (being observed in synagogues or identified by their dress). Recent examples of physical harm attacks are:

- In April 2010 a 25 year old male named Aryeh Leib Misinzov was kidnapped from a Kyiv synagogue by a neo-Nazi gang and later murdered. The attack reportedly took place on the anniversary of Adolf Hitler’s birthday.²⁵ Other sources suggested the attack could not be confirmed as anti-Semitic and claimed the victim was involved in organised crime.²⁶
- In September 2010 an Israeli Jew was stabbed and his brother beaten in Uman in central Ukraine. The brothers were in Ukraine to assist a Jewish pilgrimage to the

¹⁸ ‘Anti-Semitism in Ukraine in 2008’ 2008, European Jewish Press, 8 September <http://www.ejpress.org/article/30052> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 18 & Fellner, D. 2008, ‘The Jewish Traveler: Lvov’, *Hadassah Magazine*, April 2008 Vol. 89 No. 8, http://www.hadassahmagazine.org/site/c.twI6LmN7IzF/b.5766909/k.20B2/April_2008_Vol_89_No_8.htm - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 17.

¹⁹ Matveyev, V. 2010, ‘Anti-Semitism in Western Ukraine’, *Проза py (Prose Faith)*, 26 March, <http://www.proza.ru/2010/07/16/1190> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 18.

²⁰ ‘Global Anti-Semitism: Selected Incidents Around the World in 2010’ 2010, Anti-Defamation League, Undated, http://www.adl.org/Anti_semitism/anti-semitism_global_incidents_2010.asp - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 19.

²¹ ‘Anti-Semitism in Ukraine 2010’ 2010, Human Rights Without Frontiers, 7 October <http://www.hrwf.org/Joom/images/reports/2010/2010%20antisemitism%20Ukraine.pdf> - Accessed 11 February 2011 - Attachment 20.

²² United States Department of State 2010, *Report on International Religious Freedom - Ukraine*, 17 November, Section III - Accessed 11 February 2011 - Attachment 21.

²³ Likhachev, V. 2009, ‘The dynamics of manifestations of anti-Semitism in Ukraine’, *Euro-Asian Jewish Congress*, 30 April, <http://eajc.org/page34/news73.html> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 22

²⁴ ‘2008-2009 Review of Anti-Semitism in the FSU’ 2010, Euro-Asian Jewish Congress, 16 May <http://eajc.org/page34/news17325.html> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 23.

²⁵ ‘Yeshiva student murdered in Ukraine’ 2010, The Jerusalem Post, 5 September <http://www.jpost.com/JewishWorld/JewishNews/Article.aspx?id=175070> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 24.

²⁶ ‘EAJC: no grounds for speaking of anti-Semitic motive for Kyiv murder’ 2010, Human Rights in Ukraine, 10 May <http://www.khpg.org.ua/en/index.php?id=1273441189> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 25.

grave of a prominent rabbi.²⁷ Three men attacked the victim's car with stones and during a subsequent argument the victim was stabbed three times. Two men were subsequently arrested and charged with the crime. Police were unable to say if the attack was racially motivated or a drunken crime of opportunity.²⁸

Anti-Semitic acts appear to be carried out by a relatively small section of the community usually associated with Ukrainian-ethnic nationalist or Neo-Nazi/fascist groups. *The Roth Institute* reports that these groups appear to be organised and engage in activities including street marches and property attacks on a regular basis in major Ukrainian cities, including Lviv. These activities target other ethnic groups they consider non-Ukrainian, including Russians and Poles, as well as Jews.²⁹

The number of reported incidents of harm against Jewish citizens needs to be treated with some caution. It is noted by some non-government organisations (NGOs) that victims of anti-Semitic attacks are often reluctant to report them to the police as they believe the militia/police members to be racist. It is also noted that police do not keep statistics of racially motivated crime, and therefore it is difficult to make a totally accurate assessment of the level of anti-Semitic attacks. In the absence of official statistics, information on hate crimes in Ukraine relies on data collected by NGOs with varying methods of hate crime classification and collection methodologies.³⁰

The relationship between "ethnic Ukrainians" and Jewish people in Lviv and other parts of western Ukraine is complicated by its history. This part of Ukraine only became unified with the rest of the country after being transferred from Polish to Soviet control after World War II.³¹ Some of the most violent anti-Jewish pogroms took place in Lviv with the local populations apparently willing participants after being incited by misleading propaganda spread by the invading Nazis.³²

4. What is the attitude of the Ukrainian authorities, such as the Militia, to acts of harm directed towards Jews?

Notwithstanding that the rights of minorities in Ukraine are protected by the constitution and the Ukrainian criminal code, the general attitude of Ukrainian authorities is, in practice, indifference. Authorities, including the militia, often downplay anti-Semitic attacks describing

²⁷ 'Anti-Semitism in Ukraine 2010' 2010, Human Rights Without Frontiers, 7 October <http://www.hrwf.org/Joom/images/reports/2010/2010%20antisemitism%20ukraine.pdf> - Accessed 11 February 2011 - Attachment 20.

²⁸ 'Uman - Ukraine Arrest Two Over Anti-Semitic Murder of Breslov Bochor' 2010, Vos Iz Neias, 27 September <http://www.vosizneias.com/64961/2010/09/27/uman-ukraine-arrest-two-over-anti-semitic-murder-of-breslov-bochor> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 26.

²⁹ The Stephen Roth Institute for the study of contemporary Anti-Semitism and racism 2005, 'Country Reports: Ukraine' undated, <http://www.tau.ac.il/Anti-Semitism/asw97-8/ukraine.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 27.

³⁰ Schiffer, S., Katsbert, T., Roßmann, S. 2010, 'Hate Crime in the Ukraine Victim groups and counselling programs of civil society actors', p. 5, February http://www.european-exchange.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Hate_Crime_EVZ/Hate_Crime_Ukraine_2010_EN.pdf - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 28.

³¹ Encyclopædia Britannica 2011, Lviv, <http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/352437/Lviv> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 16.

³² Fellner, D. 2008, 'The Jewish Traveler: Lvov', *Hadassah Magazine*, April 2008 Vol. 89 No. 8, http://www.hadassahmagazine.org/site/c.twI6LmN7IzF/b.5766909/k.20B2/April_2008_Vol_89_No_8.htm - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 17.

them as acts of ‘hooliganism’ rather than anti-Semitic. The militia do prosecute perpetrators of attacks on Jewish people and businesses although hate crimes legislation is rarely utilised.

The Militia

Militia (or Militsiya) is used as a generic term for police and security forces in Ukraine and falls under the control of the Ministry for Internal Affairs.³³ The militia structure was inherited from the Soviet model in place at the time of independence. Historically, the Militia has been an arm of the state and linked to the state control of society and limitations on individual freedom. After independence, the Ukrainian militia continued to be organised along military lines with directors appointed from its own ranks and little to no civilian controls.³⁴ In this time, the militia had a reputation for being lawless and was linked to extra-judicial killings and corruption.³⁵

In addition to basic policing and law enforcement, the militia is responsible for administering criminal sentences and administrative penalties. The roles of the militia as set out under the ‘*Law of Ukraine on Militia*’. *Global Security* summarises these responsibilities as:

- a) provide personal security for citizens;
- b) protect their rights and freedoms;
- c) prevent and combat crime;
- d) maintain public order;
- e) reveal and detect crime;
- f) arrest offenders;
- g) maintain safety on the roads;
- h) protect public and private property; and
- i) execute criminal sentences and administrative penalties³⁶

In recent years the militia has been brought under the control of the parliament with civilian ministers and a move to a more westernised system.³⁷ As such, the record of the militia has

³³Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine 2010, *Structure*, 12 May <http://www.mvs.gov.ua/mvs/control/main/en/publish/article/207468;jsessionid=C3FDB00FD0C496EC1DB7E99ECC51E1E6> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 29.

³⁴ Beck, A. 2005, ‘Reflections on Policing in Post-Soviet Ukraine: A Case Study of Continuity’, *The Journal of Power Institutions in Post-Soviet Societies*, Issue 2, <http://pipss.revues.org/index294.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 30.

³⁵ ‘Ukraine Ministry of Internal Affairs’ Undated, *Global Security*, <http://www.globalsecurity.org/intell/world/ukraine/mia.htm> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 31.

³⁶ ‘Ukraine Ministry of Internal Affairs’ Undated, *Global Security*, <http://www.globalsecurity.org/intell/world/ukraine/mia.htm> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 31.

³⁷ Beck, A. 2005, ‘Reflections on Policing in Post-Soviet Ukraine: A Case Study of Continuity’, *The Journal of Power Institutions in Post-Soviet Societies*, Issue 2, <http://pipss.revues.org/index294.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 30.

improved and militia members have been convicted for actions performed on duty including assault and murder.³⁸

Attitude of authorities in Lviv

In Lviv it appears the attitude of local authorities, including the militia, towards the Jewish populations is neither hostile nor outwardly protective. A business leader in Lviv stated that the Hasidic community (an ultra-orthodox sect of Judaism) was free to develop and that he had no problems from local authorities.³⁹ Some sources noted a tendency for local authorities in Ukraine to downplay the crimes against Jewish property and people as hooliganism rather than hate crimes. The *European Commission against Race and Intolerance* in a 2007 report commented that victims are reluctant to report anti-Semitic attacks due to the perceived racism of some police officers.⁴⁰ Reports indicate that many Ukrainians hold negative opinion of the militia⁴¹ with surveys revealing citizens believe the local police are rude, corrupt, and unprofessional.⁴² There is also a belief that the militia is more interested in arrest/conviction rates rather than crime prevention.⁴³ No reports of harassment of Jewish people or groups by the local militia were located.

Constitutional and legal protections for minorities

The constitution, in particular *Article 24*, guarantees the liberty and safety of minority groups in Ukraine⁴⁴ and legislation has been passed to prevent the incitement of hatred against minorities. *Article 161* of the Ukrainian criminal code contains provision for large fines and gaol sentences of up to five years for the incitement of hatred against a person based on race or religion.⁴⁵ In 2008, sources recorded three convictions under *Article 161*, noting that the use of this legislation ‘served as a means for the state to recognize the bias motivations inherent in the crimes.’⁴⁶ As noted above, there is no collection or publication of data on the number of arrests and prosecutions of racially motivated crimes.

³⁸ US Department of State 2009, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices 2009 – Ukraine*, 11 March, <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2009/eur/136063.htm> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 32

³⁹ Matveyev, V. 2010, ‘Anti-Semitism in Western Ukraine’, *Ипоза py (Prose Faith)*, 26 March, <http://www.proza.ru/2010/07/16/1190> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 18.

⁴⁰ European Commission against Race and Intolerance 2007, *Third Report on Ukraine*, 29 June, Para 118 http://www.ecoi.net/file_upload/242_1202811332_ukraine-20third-20report-20-20cri08-4.pdf - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 33.

⁴¹ Ramukov Centre 2010, Opinion Poll: “Do you support the activity of the police (militia)? (recurrent, 2005-2010)” http://www.razumkov.org.ua/eng/poll.php?poll_id=172 - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 34.

⁴² Beck, A. 2005, ‘Reflections on Policing in Post-Soviet Ukraine: A Case Study of Continuity’, *The Journal of Power Institutions in Post-Soviet Societies*, Issue 2, <http://pipss.revues.org/index294.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 30.

⁴³ Beck, A. 2005, ‘Reflections on Policing in Post-Soviet Ukraine: A Case Study of Continuity’, *The Journal of Power Institutions in Post-Soviet Societies*, Issue 2, <http://pipss.revues.org/index294.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 30.

⁴⁴ President of Ukraine official website Undated, ‘Constitution of Ukraine Title II’ <http://www.president.gov.ua/en/content/chapter02.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 35 & Tolerance Implementation Meeting: Addressing the hate crime data deficit 2006, ‘Legislative Instruments of Ukraine Designed to Counter Hate Crime’ 10 November, <http://tandis.odihr.pl/documents/02986.pdf> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 36.

⁴⁵ Legislation online undated, *Excerpt of Ukrainian Criminal Code*, Legislation online website, <http://www.legislationonline.org/documents/action/popup/id/4143> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 37.

⁴⁶ Human Rights First 2008, *Implementation of criminal law provisions*, undated, Section III, <http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/our-work/fighting-discrimination/2008-hate-crime-survey/framework-of-criminal-law/iii-implementation-of-criminal-law-provisions/> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 38.

Current political climate

At a national level, major political groups and politicians avoid anti-Semitic rhetoric and policies. In isolated cases individuals have made anti-Semitic comments or falsely alleged that rival candidates have Jewish heritage.⁴⁷ Ukraine is a multi-party system and some minor parties have extremist agendas and policies; some of these parties have campaigned in Lviv and made speeches directly attacking and inciting hatred against Jews.⁴⁸ Parties with anti-Semitic policies or rhetoric accounted for less than 4% of the votes at the most recent federal elections although they gained most support in Western Ukraine.⁴⁹

In local elections held in October 2010, the Svoboda (Freedom) Party were victorious in many western Ukrainian areas including Lviv.⁵⁰ Among its policies, Svoboda calls for the reintroduction of Soviet-style passports and birth certificates listing the ethnicity of the subject⁵¹ (it is unclear how they would classify Jewish Ukrainians). Most Ukrainian election analysts opine that the success of Svoboda was based more on a combination of dissatisfaction with the pro-Russian government in combination with the decline of the existing opposition rather than an appeal to anti-Semitic public sentiment.⁵² It should also be noted that any change to the format of identification documents would need to be passed by federal parliament where Svoboda and other parties described as extremist failed in the 2007 elections to achieve the 3% threshold required to gain representation.⁵³

Attachments

1. United States Court of Appeals Seventh Circuit 2008, *355 F.3d 1038 Vassili KOURSKI, Petitioner, v. John ASHCROFT, Attorney General of the United States, Respondent*, January 22 <http://ftp.resource.org/courts.gov/c/F3/355/355.F3d.1038.03-1742.html> - Accessed 1 February 2011.
2. Simons, W. 1980, *The Soviet Codes of Law*, Sijthoff & Noordhoff International Publishers, The Netherlands, p. 810, Googlebooks.com http://books.google.com.au/books?id=n_w8t0UCFRgC&printsec=frontcover&dq=The+Soviet+Codes+of+Law&hl=en&ei=TbNUTfrpFcKPcf_MmKcF&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CCwQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011.

⁴⁷ 'Presidential Campaign Gets Dirty as Leaflets Smear Prime Minister as 'Jew' 2010, *Vos Lz Neias*, 4 February <http://www.vosizneias.com/48641/2010/02/04/lviv-ukraine-presidential-campaign-gets-dirty-leaflets-smear-prime-minister-as-%E2%80%98jew%E2%80%99/> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 39.

⁴⁸ 'Ukrainian Appeals To Anti-Semitism In Election Win' 2010, *Kiev Ukraine News Blog*, 5 November <http://news.kievukraine.info/2010/11/ukrainian-appeals-to-anti-semitism-in.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 40.

⁴⁹ Matveyev, V. 2010, 'Anti-Semitism in Western Ukraine', *Ипоза py (Prose Faith)*, 26 March, <http://www.proza.ru/2010/07/16/1190> - Accessed 11 February 2011 – Attachment 18.

⁵⁰ 'Nationalist Svoboda scores election victories in western Ukraine' 2010, *Kyiv Post*, 11 November <http://www.kyivpost.com/news/politics/detail/89664/> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 41.

⁵¹ Umland, U. 2011, 'Ukraine right-wing politics: is the genie out of the bottle?', Open Democracy website, 3 January <http://www.opendemocracy.net/od-russia/andreas-umland/ukraine-right-wing-politics-is-genie-out-of-bottle#> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 42.

⁵² 'Nationalist Svoboda scores election victories in western Ukraine' 2010, *Kyiv Post*, 11 November <http://www.kyivpost.com/news/politics/detail/89664/> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 41.

⁵³ Central Election Commission of Ukraine 2007, *The Election of the People's Deputies of Ukraine*, <http://www.cvk.gov.ua/pls/vnd2007/w6p001e> - Accessed 14 February 2011 – Attachment 43.

3. US Department of Justice 1994, *The Status of Jews in the post-Soviet era*, September, p. 30 <http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/ins/russia94.pdf> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
4. Haarmann, H.1986, *Language in ethnicity: a view of basic ecological relations*, Walter de Gruyter & Co, Berlin, p. 62, Googlebooks.com http://books.google.com.au/books?id=NUh_nsJpbMoC&printsec=frontcover&dq=Language+in+ethnicity:+a+view+of+basic+ecological+relations&hl=en&ei=OLhUTdv4I4WkuAPRmLXvBA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CC4Q6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011.
5. Matlin, A. Undated, 'The Jews Behind the Iron Curtain', Alexander Matlin website <http://sites.google.com/site/alexandermatlin/my-stories/stories-in-english/the-jews-behind-the-iron-curtain> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
6. Umland, A. 2005, 'Ukraine's Party System in Transition? The Rise of the Radically Right-Wing All-Ukrainian Association Svoboda', Geopolitika, <http://www.geopolitika.lt/?artc=4429> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
7. 'Soviet birth certificate', undated, Flickr website, <http://www.flickr.com/photos/heroiclif/369583440/> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
8. 'Translation of єврей', undated, Google translation website, http://translate.google.com.au/translate_t?hl=&ie=UTF-8&text=%D0%95%D0%B2%D1%80%D0%B5%D0%B9&sl=uk&tl=en#en|uk|jew - Accessed 11 February 2011. Please note: Google translations can often be poor and can contain errors - as such they give only a rough indication of the contents of a document. For any further reliance on this information, a professional translations should be obtained.
9. 'Translation of єврейка', undated, Google translation website, http://translate.google.com.au/translate_t?hl=&ie=UTF-8&text=%D0%95%D0%B2%D1%80%D0%B5%D0%B9&sl=uk&tl=en#en|uk|jewess - Accessed 11 February 2011. Please note: Google translations can often be poor and can contain errors - as such they give only a rough indication of the contents of a document. For any further reliance on this information, a professional translations should be obtained.
10. Walkowitz, D. 1995, 'Normal Life in the New Ukraine: The Crisis of Identity Among Donetsk's Miners', *Radical History Review*: Volume 61, Winter, p. 65, Googlebooks.com http://books.google.com.au/books?id=d4alhZ6KgVUC&pg=RA1-PA65&dq=first+Ukrainian+passports+1991&hl=en&ei=BZNUTa-3HcmPcZibvLsF&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=8&ved=0CE4Q6AEwBzge#v=onepage&q=first%20Ukrainian%20passports%201991&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011.
11. MacIsaac , D. Undated, 'Ukraine's Jews Say Fear Led to Low Numbers in Recent Census', The Jewish Federations of North America, <http://www.jewishfederations.org/page.aspx?id=38917> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
12. Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly 2001, *The propiska system applied to migrants, asylum seekers and refugees in Council of Europe member states: effects and remedies*, 12 October.

- <http://assembly.coe.int/Documents/WorkingDocs/Doc01/edoc9262.htm> - Accessed 11 February 2011
13. Ginsburgs, G., 1998, *From Soviet to Russian international law: studies in continuity and change*, Kluwer Law International, The Hague, p. 206, Googlebooks.com
http://books.google.com.au/books?id=HOf3eV3OzokC&printsec=frontcover&dq=From+Soviet+to+Russian+international+law:+studies+in+continuity+and+change&hl=en&ei=WsVUTc7fNYLYuAPg0uj2BA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CDIQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false - Accessed 11 February 2011. 0
 14. 'Picture of Ukrainian passport', undated, Flickr website,
<http://www.flickr.com/photos/44241312@N08/4059231962/in/photostream/> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 15. 'Picture of Ukrainian passport of Nina Mesonzhnik', undated, Center for Russian Migration website, <http://www.center-migracia.ru/passport-ukraine-zagran.html> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 16. Encyclopædia Britannica 2011, *Lviv*,
<http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/352437/Lviv> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
 17. Fellner, D. 2008, 'The Jewish Traveler: Lvov', *Hadassah Magazine*, April 2008 Vol. 89 No. 8,
http://www.hadassahmagazine.org/site/c.twI6LmN7IzF/b.5766909/k.20B2/April_2008_Vol_89_No_8.htm - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 18. Matveyev, V. 2010, 'Anti-Semitism in Western Ukraine', *Проза py (Prose Faith)*, 26 March, <http://www.proza.ru/2010/07/16/1190> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 19. 'Global Anti-Semitism: Selected Incidents Around the World in 2010' 2010, Anti-Defamation League, Undated, http://www.adl.org/Anti_semitism/anti-semitism_global_incidents_2010.asp - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 20. 'Anti-Semitism in Ukraine 2010' 2010, Human Rights Without Frontiers, 7 October
<http://www.hrwf.org/Joom/images/reports/2010/2010%20antisemitism%20ukraine.pdf> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 21. United States Department of State 2010, *Report on International Religious Freedom - Ukraine*, 17 November, Section III, - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 22. Likhachev, V. 2009, 'The dynamics of manifestations of anti-Semitism in Ukraine', *Euro-Asian Jewish Congress*, 30 April, <http://ejjc.org/page34/news73.html> - Accessed 11 February 2011
 23. '2008-2009 Review of Anti-Semitism in the FSU' 2010, Euro-Asian Jewish Congress, 16 May <http://ejjc.org/page34/news17325.html> - Accessed 11 February 2011.
 24. 'Yeshiva student murdered in Ukraine' 2010, The Jerusalem Post, 5 September
<http://www.jpost.com/JewishWorld/JewishNews/Article.aspx?id=175070> - Accessed 14 February 2011.

25. 'EAJC: no grounds for speaking of anti-Semitic motive for Kyiv murder' 2010, Human Rights in Ukraine, 10 May <http://www.khpg.org.ua/en/index.php?id=1273441189> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
26. 'Uman - Ukraine Arrest Two Over Anti-Semitic Murder of Breslov Bochur' 2010, Vos lz Neias, 27 September <http://www.vosizneias.com/64961/2010/09/27/uman-ukraine-arrest-two-over-anti-semitic-murder-of-breslov-bochur> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
27. The Stephen Roth Institute for the study of contemporary Anti-Semitism and racism 2005, 'Country Reports: Ukraine' undated, <http://www.tau.ac.il/Anti-Semitism/asw97-8/ukraine.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
28. Schiffer, S., Katsbert, T., Roßmann, S. 2010, 'Hate Crime in the Ukraine Victim groups and counselling programs of civil society actors', p. 5, February http://www.european-exchange.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Hate_Crime_EVZ/Hate_Crime_Ukraine_2010_EN.pdf - Accessed 14 February 2011.
29. Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine 2010, *Structure*, 12 May <http://www.mvs.gov.ua/mvs/control/main/en/publish/article/207468;jsessionid=C3FDB00FD0C496EC1DB7E99ECC51E1E6> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
30. Beck, A. 2005, 'Reflections on Policing in Post-Soviet Ukraine: A Case Study of Continuity', *The Journal of Power Institutions in Post-Soviet Societies*, Issue 2, <http://pipss.revues.org/index294.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
31. 'Ukraine Ministry of Internal Affairs' Undated, Global Security, <http://www.globalsecurity.org/intell/world/ukraine/mia.htm> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
32. US Department of State 2009, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices 2009 – Ukraine*, 11 March, <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2009/eur/136063.htm> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
33. European Commission against Race and Intolerance 2007, *Third Report on Ukraine*, 29 June, Para 118 http://www.ecoi.net/file_upload/242_1202811332_ukraine-20third-20report-20-20cri08-4.pdf - Accessed 14 February 2011.
34. Ramukov Centre 2010, Opinion Poll: "Do you support the activity of the police (militia)? (recurrent, 2005-2010)" http://www.razumkov.org.ua/eng/poll.php?poll_id=172 - Accessed 14 February 2011.
35. President of Ukraine official website Undated, 'Constitution of Ukraine Title II' <http://www.president.gov.ua/en/content/chapter02.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
36. Tolerance Implementation Meeting: Addressing the hate crime data deficit 2006, 'Legislative Instruments of Ukraine Designed to Counter Hate Crime' 10 November, <http://tandis.odihr.pl/documents/02986.pdf> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
37. Legislation online undated, *Excerpt of Ukrainian Criminal Code*, Legislation online website, <http://www.legislationonline.org/documents/action/popup/id/4143> - Accessed 14 February 2011.

38. Human Rights First 2008, *Implementation of criminal law provisions*, undated, Section III, <http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/our-work/fighting-discrimination/2008-hate-crime-survey/framework-of-criminal-law/iii-implementation-of-criminal-law-provisions/> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
39. 'Presidential Campaign Gets Dirty as Leaflets Smear Prime Minister as 'Jew' 2010, *Vos Lz Neias*, 4 February <http://www.vosizneias.com/48641/2010/02/04/lviv-ukraine-presidential-campaign-gets-dirty-leaflets-smear-prime-minister-as-%E2%80%98jew%E2%80%99/> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
40. 'Ukrainian Appeals To Anti-Semitism In Election Win' 2010, *Kiev Ukraine News Blog*, 5 November <http://news.kievukraine.info/2010/11/ukrainian-appeals-to-anti-semitism-in.html> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
41. 'Nationalist Svoboda scores election victories in western Ukraine' 2010, *Kyiv Post*, 11 November <http://www.kyivpost.com/news/politics/detail/89664/> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
42. Umland, U. 2011, 'Ukraine right-wing politics: is the genie out of the bottle?', Open Democracy website, 3 January <http://www.opendemocracy.net/od-russia/andreas-umland/ukraine-right-wing-politics-is-genie-out-of-bottle#> - Accessed 14 February 2011.
43. Central Election Commission of Ukraine 2007, *The Election of the People's Deputies of Ukraine*, <http://www.cvk.gov.ua/pls/vnd2007/w6p001e> - Accessed 14 February 2011.